

Attachment 11.1

**Confidential - Contract No. 09032 Christie Creek Upgrade - Morrow Road
Sedimentation Ponds**

4 pages



City of
Onkaparinga

Tender Evaluation Summary

Contract No: 09032

Contract Name: Morrow Road Sedimentation Pond

Tenders were invited by open tender process.

Tenders closed at 2pm on Tuesday 19 May 2009 at which time five tenders were received from the tenders who are listed in table 1 (below).

Table 1 – Tenders received from:

Name of Tenderer	Price (inc GST)
PD Excavations Pty Ltd	\$1,371,021.85
McMahon Services	\$1,882,541.00
ADCIV Pty Ltd	\$1,524,690.33
ERTECH Pty Ltd	\$1,559,768.24
SA Civil	\$1,195,266.33

The Tenders were assessed in accordance with Clause 23 "Evaluation of Tenders" of Council's Administration Procedure "Procurement". This procedure requires that tenders are assessed by an evaluation panel using a weighted matrix to rank the tenderers in order of preference.

The evaluation panel comprised the people listed as recommended by in table 2 (below).

Table 2 – Evaluation Panel Members

Name	Position Title
Benjamin Hall	Project Leader (Water Proofing the South)
Kirk Richardson	Manager, Infrastructure
Andrew Thomas	Work Group Coordinator – Water Resources
Steven Gatti	AMLRNRM Board Manager Projects and Investigations

The tender assessment process was observed by Tim Dawson, Probity Auditor and Kathryn Kuchel, Contracts Engineer.

The scores for Price were automatically generated by the Tender Management System using the formula adopted from Association Consulting Engineers Australia (ACEA) as follows:

$$S = 5 + 10 \times \frac{(\$M - \$T)}{\$M}$$

Where: S = Score (Max 10), \$M = Median Price, \$T = Tendered Price

Scores for the remaining criteria were allocated qualitatively by agreement of the evaluation panel using standard procedure based on scoring in the range of 0 to 10, with 5 being acceptable. A full summary of the evaluation criteria, weightings and allocated scores is provided as tables 3 and 4.

The evaluation panel has selected ADCIV Pty Ltd as the preferred supplier and recommends that their Tender for \$1,524,690.33 (including GST) be accepted.

Table 3 – Assessment of Mandatory Evaluation Criteria

Mandatory Criteria	Tenderer				
	PD Excavations	McMahon Services	ADCIV	Ertech Pty Ltd	SA CIVIL
Indicative Evidence of any accreditations certifications, licences, registrations or permits <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Contractor's Licence, including Supervisor's Registration</i> 	✓	✓	✓	x	✓
Indicative Evidence of the following policies of Insurance <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Public Liability (20 Million Dollars)</i> • <i>Work Cover Registration or Exemption</i> • <i>Contract Works – Contract Value + 10%</i> 	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓

Table 4 – Qualitative Evaluation Criteria, Weightings and Scores

Qualitative Criteria	Weighting %	Tenderer									
		PD Excavations		McMahon Services		ADCIV		Ertech Pty Ltd		SA Civil	
		Score (Max 10)	Weighted Score %	Score (Max 10)	Weighted Score %	Score (Max 10)	Weighted Score %	Score (Max 10)	Weighted Score %	Score (Max 10)	Weighted Score %
Cost <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Whether the tender represents value for money; and Cost against budget 	30%	6.01	18.02	2.65	7.96	5.00	15.00	7.16	21.48		
Accreditations & Certifications <ul style="list-style-type: none"> That the Tenderer is appropriately licensed and accredited 	20%	8	16	8	16	8	16	8	16		
Capability <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The experience and capability of the Tenderer to perform the Contract. 	20%	3	6	8	16	8.2	16.4	4	8	<i>non-compliant with mandatory criteria</i>	
Capacity <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Tenderer's capacity to undertake the works within the nominated timeframe 	10%	6	6	6	6	5	5	5	5		
Methodology, incl Appreciation of Task <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The methods of work proposed by the Tenderer. 	20%	5	10	7	14	6	12	5	10		
Totals	100%		56.02%		59.96%		64.4%		60.48%		

C.T.S.

Global Procurement Consultants

ABN 58 791 031 312

Contracting & Tendering Services Pty Ltd.
Level 3, 170 Greenhill Road
Parkside SA 5063
Phone + 61 8 8272 9099
Fax + 8 8272 8833

email: tim.dawson@ct-services.com.au
www.contractingandtenderingservices.com.au

Mr Ben Hall
Project Leader
Water Proofing the South
City of Onkaparinga
PO Box 1
Noarlunga Centre SA 5168

3 June 2009

Dear Ben

Re: PM 2 Christies Creek Upgrade (Morrow Road Sedimentation Pond)

Contracting and Tendering Services Pty Ltd (CTS) has been appointed to provide probity services to the City of Onkaparinga for the Water Proofing the South Project, encompassing the above project.

CTS' standard methodology involves confirmation of critical tasks within the following broad stages of the procurement process:

- Procurement planning;
- Market documents;
- Invitation & receipt;
- Evaluation & negotiation;
- Recommendation.

The above project has progressed to the Recommendation stage with a recommendation to be put to Council for the award of a contract.

At this time you have requested that CTS provide probity assurance of the procurement process to date, recognising that the scope of tasks to be reviewed in the Recommendation stage is not yet complete.

To date, CTS is not aware of any material fact or circumstance that has compromised the procurement process and is satisfied that the requirements for probity have been adhered to. As per the agreed methodology CTS will submit a Final Probity Report covering the full scope of tasks to be reviewed in due course once the contract has been awarded.

Yours sincerely



Tim Dawson
Principal Consultant
Contracting & Tendering Services Pty. Ltd.