

Attachment 11.1

Confidential – contract number 09043 Christie Creek Upgrade Wilfred Taylor Reserve Flood Mitigation, Water Capture and Reuse (design and construction)

5 pages



City of
Onkaparinga

Tender Evaluation Summary

Contract No: 09043

Contract Name: Wilfred Taylor Reserve – Flood Mitigation, Water Capture & Reuse Design & Construct

Tenders were invited by select tender process as a result of a previous Expression of Interest process.

Tenders closed at 2pm 30 July 2009 at which time three tenders were received from the tenders who are listed in table 1 (below):

Table 1 – Tenders received from:

Name of Tenderer
ABIGroup Contractors
Leed Engineering and Construction Pty Ltd
York Civil

The Tenders were assessed in accordance with Clause 23 "Evaluation of Tenders" of Council's Administration Procedure "Procurement". This procedure requires that tenders are assessed by an evaluation panel using a weighted matrix to rank the tenderers in order of preference.

The evaluation panel comprised the people listed as recommended by in table 2 (below):

Table 2 – Evaluation Panel Members

Name	Position Title
Benjamin Hall	Project Leader (Water Proofing the South)
Kirk Richardson	Manager, Infrastructure
Phil Bickley	Team Leader Design
Mark Grundy	Project Officer
Chris Wright	AMLRNRM Board Water Projects Officer

The tender assessment process was observed by Tim Dawson, Probity Auditor and Kathryn Kuchel Contracts Engineer.

Scores for the desirable criteria were allocated qualitatively by agreement of the evaluation panel using standard procedure based on scoring in the range of 0 to 10, with 5 being acceptable. A full summary of the evaluation criteria, weightings and allocated scores is provided as tables 3 and 4 (next page).

The evaluation panel has selected Leed Engineering as the preferred supplier and recommends that their Tender be accepted.

Table 4 – Assessment of Desirable Criteria

Criteria	Weighting %	Tenderer							
		ABIGroup		Lead Engineering		York Civil		Weighted Score %	Score (Max 10)
		Score (Max 10)	Weighted Score %	Score (Max 10)	Weighted Score %	Score (Max 10)	Weighted Score %		
Appreciation of Task, Methodology	10%	4	4	7	7	7	7	7	7
Work Methods	20%	2	4	7	14	7	14	7	14
Capability	30% total								
– Design (30%)	9%	6	5.4	8	7.2	6	5.4	6	5.4
– Construction (50%)	15%	3	4.5	6	9	7	10.5	7	10.5
– Operation & Maintenance (20%)	6%	3	1.8	7	4.2	1	0.6	1	0.6
Capacity	40%	3	12	5	20	6	24	6	24
Totals	100		31.7		61.4		61.5		61.5

Table 5 – Risk Evaluation - Criteria and Assessment

Criteria		Tenderer		
		ABIGroup	Leed Engineering	York Civil
Project Risk – Assessment		<p>Extreme</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Bid exceeds project budget Second offer has no methodology, costing etc, so it cannot be assessed Second offer indicates that elements of the project have been deleted to meet project budget of \$12.3 million 	<p>Medium</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Flood mitigation (42m³/s) not yet achieved in design Clay liners for wetlands may not be suitable, so alternative liners may need to be financed from contingency 	<p>High</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Core project deliverables missing; shared path, landscape & amenity, operation & maintenance Core elements required in the project are additional to the budget of \$12.3 million namely, shared use path, landscape and amenity, electricity supply and cultural heritage monitoring Spoil, disposal on site will create areas that need to be landscaped & rehabilitated, which will add additional cost to the project
Contractual Risk – Assessment		<p>Unacceptable</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Abigroup require Contractor's liability for Public Liability & Professional Indemnity Insurance to be limited to the value of their insurance 	<p>Low</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> No non-complying issues in their submission 	<p>Unacceptable</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> York Civil require Contractor's liability for Public Liability & Professional Indemnity Insurance to be limited to the value of their insurance Minor conditions of contract to be altered (such as allowance for inclement weather, overdue payments etc) – not considered a risk to Council
Contractual Risk - Comments				

C.T.S.

Global Procurement Consultants

ABN 58 791 031 312

Contracting & Tendering Services Pty Ltd.
Level 3, 170 Greenhill Road
Parkside SA 5063
Phone + 61 8 8272 9099
Fax + 8 8272 8833

email: tim.dawson@ct-services.com.au
www.contractingandtenderingservices.com.au

Mr Ben Hall
Project Leader
Water Proofing the South
City of Onkaparinga
PO Box 1
Noarlunga Centre SA 5168

11 August 2009

Dear Ben

Re: PM 2 Christies Creek Upgrade (Wilfred Taylor Reserve – Design & Construct)

Contracting and Tendering Services Pty Ltd (CTS) has been appointed to provide probity services to the City of Onkaparinga for the Water Proofing the South Project, encompassing the above project.

CTS' standard methodology involves confirmation of critical tasks within the following broad stages of the procurement process:

- Procurement planning;
- Market documents;
- Invitation & receipt;
- Evaluation & negotiation;
- Recommendation.

The above project has progressed to the Recommendation stage with a recommendation to be put to Council for the award of the design and construct contract.

At this time you have requested that CTS provide probity assurance of the procurement process to date, recognising that the scope of tasks to be reviewed in the Recommendation stage is not yet complete.

To date, CTS is not aware of any material fact or circumstance that has compromised the procurement process and is satisfied that the requirements for probity have been adhered to. As per the agreed methodology CTS will submit a Final Probity Report covering the full scope of tasks to be reviewed in due course once the contract has been awarded.

Yours sincerely



Tim Dawson
Principal Consultant
Contracting & Tendering Services Pty. Ltd.