

Attachment 11.1

**Confidential - Contract No. 11031 Reconstruction of Taylors Avenue, Morphett
Vale**

5 pages



Tender evaluation summary

Contract No: 11031

Contract Name: Taylor Avenue Morphett Vale – Road Upgrade

Tenders were invited by open tender process.

Tenders closed at 2.00pm on Tuesday 27 September 2011 at which time five tenders were received from the tenderers who are listed in table 1 (below).

Table 1 – Tenders received from:

Name of Tenderer	Price (inc GST)
ADCIV Pty Ltd	\$1,248,011.03
BMD Constructions Pty Ltd	\$1,644,914.48
SA Civil	\$1,334,912.50
SEM Civil	\$1,643,619.43
T & J Constructions	\$1,518,989.99

The Tenders were assessed in accordance with Clause 23 "Evaluation of Tenders" of Council's Administration Procedure "Procurement". This procedure requires that tenders are assessed by an evaluation panel using a weighted matrix to rank the tenderers in order of preference.

The evaluation panel comprised the people listed as recommended in table 2 (below).

Table 2 – Evaluation Panel Members

Name	Position Title
Dawyd Pinter	Project Officer
Adrian Lamont	Senior Design Officer
Paul Wreford	Senior Technical Officer

The process was observed by Kathryn Kuchel, Contracts Engineer and Tim Dawson, Probity Auditor Contracting & Tendering Services.

The scores for Price were automatically generated by the Tender Management System using the formula adopted from Association Consulting Engineers Australia (ACEA) as follows:

$$S = 5 + 10 \times \frac{(\$M - \$T)}{\$M}$$

Where: S = Score (Max 10), \$M = Median Price, \$T = Tendered Price

Scores for the remaining criteria were allocated qualitatively by agreement of the evaluation panel using standard procedure based on scoring in the range of 0 to 10, with 5 being acceptable. A full summary of the evaluation criteria, weightings and allocated scores is provided as table 3 (next page).

The evaluation panel has selected T & J Constructions as the preferred supplier and recommends that their Tender for \$1,518,989.99 be accepted.

Table 3 – Mandatory Evaluation Criteria

Criteria	Tenderer				
	ADCIV Pty Ltd	BMD Constructions Pty Ltd	SA CIVIL	SEM CIVIL	T & J Constructions
Civil Works Licence	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Insurances					
<i>Public Liability</i>	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
<i>WorkCover</i>	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
<i>Motor Vehicle</i>	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
<i>Contract Works</i>	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Management Systems					
<i>OHS&W</i>	✓ AS4801	✓ AS4801	✓ CCF	✓ AS4801	✓ CCF
<i>Environment</i>	✓ AS14001	✓ AS14001	✓ CCF	✓ AS14001	✓ CCF
<i>Quality</i>	✓ AS9001	✓ AS9001	✓ CCF	✓ AS9001	✓ CCF
<i>Risk</i>	✓ AS4360	✓ internal	✓ AS4360	✓	✓ internal
OUTCOME	PASS	PASS	PASS	PASS	PASS

Table 4 – Qualitative Evaluation Criteria

Criteria	Weighting %	Tenderer									
		ADCIV Pty Ltd		BMD Constructions Pty Ltd		SA Civil		SEM Civil		T & J Constructions	
		Score (Max 10)	Weighted Score %	Score (Max 10)	Weighted Score %	Score (Max 10)	Weighted Score %	Score (Max 10)	Weighted Score %	Score (Max 10)	Weighted Score %
Price <i>To assess whether the tender represents value for money and cost against budget</i>	45%	6.78	30.51	4.17	18.77	6.21	27.95	4.18	18.81	5	22.5
Demonstrated Ability <i>To assess the experience and capability of the tender to perform the contract</i>	15%	8	12	7	10.5	6	9	7	10.5	8	12
Current Commitments / Time <i>To assess the availability of the tenderer</i>	10%	5	5	8	8	7	7	8	8	8	8
Methodology / Appreciation of Task <i>To assess The methods of work proposed by the tenderer, & The tenderer's understanding of the project outcomes or scope of work</i>	30%	3	9	8	24	6	18	8	24	7	21
Totals	100		56.51		61.27		61.95		61.31		63.5

Table 5 – Risk Assessment Criteria

Criteria	Tenderer				
	ADCIV Pty Ltd	BMD Constructions Pty Ltd	SA Civil	SEM Civil	T & J Constructions
Contractual Compliance	L	L	L	L	L
Specification Compliance	L	L	L	M	L
Local Employment	L	L	L	M	L
OUTCOME	PASS	PASS	PASS	PASS	PASS

C.T.S.

Global Procurement Consultants

ABN 58 791 031 312

Contracting & Tendering Services Pty Ltd.
Level 3, 170 Greenhill Road
Parkside SA 5063
Phone + 61 8 8272 9099
Fax + 8 8272 8833

email: tim.dawson@ct-services.com.au
www.contractingandtenderingservices.com.au

Ms Kathryn Kuchel
Contracts Engineer
City of Onkaparinga
PO Box 1
Noarlunga Centre SA 5168

25 October 2011

Dear Kathryn

Re: Interim Probity Report (Contract Award): Taylors Avenue, Morphett Vale - Road Upgrade (11031)

Contracting and Tendering Services Pty Ltd (CTS) has been appointed to provide probity services to the City of Onkaparinga for the above project.

CTS' standard methodology as stated in the project's Probity Plan involves confirmation of tasks within the following broad stages of the procurement process: (i) procurement planning; (ii) market documents; (iii) invitation & receipt; (iv) evaluation & negotiation; and (v) recommendation.

The above project has progressed to the recommendation stage with the recommendation of Mr. Bruce Williams (General Manager Projects & Services) to award the contract to T & J Constructions Pty Ltd to be submitted for approval at the Council meeting to be held on 1 November 2011 (the recommendation was sighted by CTS on 25 October 2011).

At this time you have requested that CTS provide probity assurance of the procurement process to date, including this recommendation, recognising that the scope of probity tasks is not yet complete.

To date, CTS is not aware of any material fact or circumstance that has compromised the procurement process and is satisfied that the requirements for probity have been adhered to. As per the agreed methodology stated in the project's Probity Plan CTS will submit a Final Probity Report covering the full scope of tasks from CTS' standard methodology in due course once the contract has been awarded.

Yours sincerely



Tim Dawson
Director
Contracting & Tendering Services Pty. Ltd.